



LEADERSHIP LEARNING COMMUNITY

If you wish to be heard, first learn to listen. If you seek to lead others, first learn to lead yourself. Rev. Peter Donohue O.S.A., President, Villanova University
 Augustine and Culture Seminar 1000 V09, V10
 Traditions in Conversation
 Fall 2008, Immerwahr, Kemp, Miraglia
 Rubrics for Evaluating Papers

	Strong work ¹	Needs development	Unsatisfactory
Audience	Assumes audience is student who has read assigned texts carefully; paper uses evidence to make points rather than to summarize	Spends inappropriate amount of time merely summarizing text or repeating material covered in class	Shows little evidence of having read the text; ideas mostly taken from class notes or class discussion
Thesis	Single clear thesis that would be insightful and interesting to someone who had already studied the texts	Thesis is either somewhat unclear or all too obvious to most thoughtful readers	No clear thesis, or multiple theses
Introductory paragraph(s)	Avoids inflated generalizations and gratuitous praise; sets brief context; introduces clear thesis	Extraneous generalization; connection to thesis not entirely clear; thesis statement not clear	No clear thesis statement or sense of where the paper is going
Paragraphs in body of paper	Strong topic sentences, supported by evidence and argumentation; topic sentences support main thesis	Some topic sentences do not support thesis, or are not supported by evidence in paragraph	No topic sentences; or little relationship between topic sentences and thesis; or no evidence for topic sentences
Argument	All necessary points in proving or developing thesis are made; makes compelling argument for thesis; paper does not assume reader agrees with author	Some missteps are made in proving or developing thesis; argument only compelling to someone who already agrees	Essay fails to prove or develop any sort of compelling thesis
Organization	Argument intelligently ordered and easy to follow, reflected in order of points and paragraphs	Logical flow of argument needs improvement by reordering some points and/or paragraphs	Material is disorganized with no clear logical order between points and/or paragraphs
Use of Evidence	Draws evidence from close reading of a variety of passages; evidence is appropriate to points being made; all quotations cited using MLA format	Evidence drawn from only one or two passages in text; some evidence does not support points made; citations present but not in correct format	Little evidence used; does not support points made; drawn entirely from class discussion; material quoted without citation
Conclusion	Hints at implications, broader conclusions, or insightful ideas to think about, based on analysis so far	Summarizes everything that has been said so far but does not leave the reader with something further to think about	Essay fails to offer a satisfactory conclusion and/or simply recycles the introductory paragraph.
Mechanics	Nearly flawless grammar, spelling, and word choice; sentences read smoothly and are clear without being wordy	Grammar, spelling, word choice, sentence structure and/or word economy need attention	Serious problems with grammar, spelling, word choice, sentence structure and/or word economy

¹ An A-level paper will be strong in most categories; B papers will be strong in some but need development in others; C papers need significant development; D papers are typically unsatisfactory in most categories; most people who get F's haven't read these criteria.